

Report Identification Number: SY-15-036 Prepared by: Syracuse Regional Office

Issue Date: 4/15/2016

This	s report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:
X	A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
	The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
	The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
	The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 1 of 12



Abbreviations

	Relationships	
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
	Contacts	
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPR-Cardio-pulmonary Resuscitation		
	Allegations	
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Others	
	Miscellaneous	
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police
Service	Services	Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services		

Case Information

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 2 of 12



Report Type: Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Broome **Date of Death:** 10/20/2015

Age: 2 month(s) Gender: Female Initial Date OCFS Notified: 10/20/2015

Presenting Information

On 10/20/15 the SCR registered a report alleging IG and DOA/Fatality against the maternal great aunt (MGA) on behalf of the 2-month-old SC. The BM was listed with an unknown role. The narrative of the report stated the following: This evening, the SC was dead on arrival to the hospital. The SC was an otherwise healthy baby. There is currently no explanation for the death. Infant did have a temperature of 103 degrees prior to death. The MGA regularly cares for the SC and her two unknown older sisters. The MGA went to check on the baby after assisting the two other children with an activity and the SC was not breathing. The BM was not home at the time and has an unknown role, as does the two older sisters.

Executive Summary

The fatality report concerns the death of a 2-month-old child. The SC was pronounced dead on 10/20/15 at 7:50pm. The autopsy listed the most likely manner of death as accidental. The cause of death is listed as, "acute congestive heart failure related to dehydration and hyperthermia." It was noted that the SC, "was undersized, with a history of failure to thrive, relating to feeding difficulties."

The BCDSS' investigation revealed that the BM was a single parent who lived in PA. The BM asked the SC's MGA to care for the SC until the BM could secure appropriate daycare for the SC. The BM cared for the SC on her days off which were Friday through Saturday. The BM then transported the SC to and from the MGA's home, so the MGA could care for the SC during the BM's work days, which were Sunday through Thursday. The SCR report mistakenly identified the two other children in the household as older siblings of the SC. The two other children (ages 9 and 6 years old) were actually the children of the MGA, and they resided in the MGA's home.

The SC was in the MGA's care on 10/20/15. Around 3:30pm, the MGA swaddled the SC in a fleece blanket and laid the SC on her back, for a nap in a Pack-N-Play. The SC had a cotton onesie on under the blanket. The child was in an upstairs dormer bedroom. A fan facing out of the bedroom window was running while the child slept. Prior to discovering the SC not breathing, the MGA had checked on the SC at various times and did not note anything of concern. At approximately 7:15pm, the MGA checked on the SC and found the SC with her eyes open and not breathing. The MGA blew in the SC's mouth and heard gurgling. The MGA turned the SC over in her arms and patted the SC's back in case there was an obstruction. The MGA ran downstairs, told the other children in the house to get the neighbor, and 911 was called. The MGA and neighbor performed CPR on the SC until EMS arrived and immediately transported the SC to the hospital, where the SC was pronounced dead. The SC's temperature upon arrival at the hospital was 103 degrees.

On 2/24/16, the BCDSS completed their investigation and unsubstantiated the allegations of IG and DOA/Fatality of the SC by the MGA. The OCFS review of the report found that the BCDSS appropriately determined the allegations in the report, as well as appropriately assessed the need for ongoing services. The ongoing safety of, and risk to, the surviving children in the home was adequately assessed. All casework activity was commensurate with case circumstances.

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 3 of 12



Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:

Approved Initial Safety Assessment?

• Safety assessment due at the time of determination?

Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?

Yes Yes

Yes

Determination:

Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the

investigation?

Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all

allegations.

• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate

appropriate?

Yes

Explain:

All caseworker activity was commensurate with case circumstances.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate?

Yes Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory

or regulatory requirements?

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?

the consultation

Yes, the case record has detail of

Explain:

All casework activity was commensurate with case circumstances.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? $\square Yes \square No$

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Incident Information

Date of Death: 10/20/2015 Time of Death: 07:50 PM

Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death: Unknown

County where fatality incident occurred: **BROOME**

Was 911 or local emergency number called? Yes

Time of Call: 07·22 PM

Did EMS to respond to the scene? Yes

At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? No

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 4 of 12



Child's activity at time of incident.

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

	☐ Working	☐ Driving / Vehicle occupant
☐ Playing	☐ Eating	☐ Unknown
☐ Other		
•	n at time of incident leading to death? You was the child last seen by caretaker? 1	
O	he Household Composition? Yes - Care	
2	ne Household Composition: 1 es Cuite	75.1.01
At time of incident superv	visor was: Not	
impaired.		
Total number of deaths at	incident event:	
Children ages 0-18: 1		

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Aunt/Uncle	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	49 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Female	2 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Other Adult	No Role	Male	28 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Other Child	No Role	Female	9 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Other Child	No Role	Female	6 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Mother	No Role	Female	32 Year(s)
Other Household 2	Father	No Role	Male	37 Year(s)

LDSS Response

The BCDSS' investigation revealed that the SC's pediatric care and immunizations were up to date. The SC wasn't ill prior to death. The BM took the SC for a well-child visit on 10/6/15 and the SC was diagnosed with a diaper rash. A well-child visit on 10/14/15 revealed that the diaper rash was getting better. At the same visit, the SC was diagnosed as failure to thrive because the SC had only gained 4 oz. in the past 8 days. The pediatrician's notes stated that formula feeding was reviewed with the BM. The pediatrician's notes didn't state that the BM was advised precautions to take regarding the SC's temperature, due to the SC being undersized. The BM acknowledged that the pediatrician talked to her about the SC's difficulty gaining weight, but denied that she was told that the SC was diagnosed as failure to thrive. The MGA denied that she was informed by the BM that the SC was failure to thrive, and denied that she was given instructions related to regulating an undersized infant's temperature. The LDSS confirmed with the pediatrician that instructions were given related to feeding only.

On 10/20/15, at around 3:30pm, the MGA swaddled the SC in a fleece blanket and laid the SC on her back, for a nap in a Pack-N-Play. The SC had a cotton onesie on under the blanket. The SC was in an upstairs dormer bedroom. There is a stairway downstairs leading into the upstairs bedroom. The door at the bottom of that stairway was open. A fan facing outside was running in the bedroom window. The outside temperature was 64 degrees Fahrenheit and the room

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 5 of 12



temperature was between 72-74 degrees Fahrenheit. The MGA stated that she swaddled the SC in the blanket as she was concerned the room may have been too cool. The MGA's adult son was in the home and she asked him to keep an eye on the SC while she went to Wal-Mart and then cashed a check. The MGA's adult son sat on the bed next to the SC and watched the SC until the MGA arrived home at about 4:00pm. The MGA checked on the SC at 4:15pm and found the SC asleep in the position she was placed in. The MGA checked on the SC twice more by going to the top of the stairs, and looking at the Pack-N-Play mattress to see if it was moving, which would have indicated to her that the SC was awake. The mattress wasn't moving, so she assumed the SC was asleep. At about 7:10pm, she walked upstairs to check on the SC and smelled feces. She looked at the SC, who was in the same position she was placed in originally, but the SC's eyes were open and the SC was not breathing. The MGA blew in the SC's mouth and heard gurgling. The MGA turned the SC over in her arms and patted the SC's back in case there was an obstruction. The MGA ran downstairs. The MGA's children and a neighbor boy were downstairs. The MGA told the children to get the neighbor boy's mother. The MGA and the neighbor performed CPR on the SC until EMS arrived and immediately transported the SC to the hospital where the SC was pronounced dead at 7:50pm. EMS noted that the SC's clothes were wet. The SC's temperature upon arrival to the hospital was 103 degrees Fahrenheit.

The autopsy listed the most likely manner of death as accidental. The cause of death is listed as, "acute congestive heart failure related to dehydration and hyperthermia." It was noted that the SC, "was undersized, with a history of failure to thrive, relating to feeding difficulties." It also noted that the SC's clothes were likely wet due to excessive sweating.

On 2/24/16, the BCDSS completed their investigation and unsubstantiated the allegations of IG and DOA/Fatality of the SC by the MGA. There was no credible evidence to support that the BM or the MGA had been informed that the child was diagnosed as failure to thrive. The MGA dressed the SC as she would an infant who wasn't undersized, not realizing the risks related to such. The SC's death was listed as accidental and the BCDSS appropriately determined that the SC's death was not related to neglect and/or abuse.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Accident

Primary Cause of Death: From an injury - external cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Coroner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? Yes

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
026341 - Deceased Child, Female, 2	026342 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 49	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
Mons	Year(s)		
026341 - Deceased Child, Female, 2	026342 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 49	Inadequate	Unsubstantiated

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 6 of 12



Mons	Year(s)	Guardia	nchin		
WIOIIS	1 Car(5)	Guaruia	шыпр		
	CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative A	Activities			
		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?		X			
When appropriate, child	lren were interviewed?	X			
Alleged subject(s) interv	riewed face-to-face?	X			
All 'other persons name	d' interviewed face-to-face?	X			
Contact with source?		×			
All appropriate Collater	rals contacted?	×			
Was a death-scene inves	tigation performed?	×			
	th all parties (youth, other household o were present that day (if nonverbal, nts in case notes)?	X			
Coordination of investig	ation with law enforcement?	X			
Was there timely entry of documentation?	of progress notes and other required	X			
	Fatality Safety Assessment Activi	ities			
		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any survivin	g siblings or other children in the household?	×			
Was there an adequate s in the household named	safety assessment of impending or immediate of in the report:	langer to si	irviving sib	lings/other	children
Within 24 hours?		X			
At 7 days?		X			
At 30 days?		X			
	Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving in the household within 24 hours?	X			
Are there any safety issu district?	ies that need to be referred back to the local		×		
	re present that placed the surviving in the household in impending or immediate			×	

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 7 of 12



danger of serious harm, were the sa parent/caretaker actions adequate?	•	entions, inc	luding				
	Fatality Risk	Assessment	/ Risk Assessi	ment Profil	e		
				1			
				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adeq	uate in this	case?		×			
During the course of the investigati gathered to assess risk to all survive household?	*			×			
Was there an adequate assessment	of the fami	ly's need fo	r services?	×			
Did the protective factors in this ca petition in Family Court at any tim investigation?	-		file a		X		
Were appropriate/needed services	offered in tl	his case				×	
Place	ement Activit	ies in Respor	se to the Fata	lity Investi	gation		
							Unable to
				Yes	No	N/A	Determine
Did the safety factors in the case sh siblings/other children in the house foster care at any time during this	hold be ren	noved or pl	_		\boxtimes		
Were there surviving siblings/other removed as a result of this fatality			hold		X		
Explain as necessary: N/A				•		•	
	Legal	Activity Rela	ated to the Fa	tality			
Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity							
Serv	vices Provide	d to the Fam	ily in Respons	se to the Fa	tality		
Services	Provided After	Offered, but	Offered, Unknown	Needed but not	Needed but	N/A	CDR Lead to

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 8 of 12



Bereavement counseling		X			
Economic support				×	
Funeral arrangements				×	
Housing assistance				×	
Mental health services				×	
Foster care				\boxtimes	
Health care				\boxtimes	
Legal services				\boxtimes	
Family planning				×	
Homemaking Services				×	
Parenting Skills				×	
Domestic Violence Services				×	
Early Intervention				×	
Alcohol/Substance abuse				×	
Child Care				×	
Intensive case management				\boxtimes	
Family or others as safety resources				X	
Other				X	

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

Information on bereavement services was provided.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

Information on bereavement services was provided.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death? Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? No

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 9 of 12



Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? N/A Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?

Infants Under One Yea	r Old
During pregnancy, mother: ☐ Had medical complications / infections ☐ Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs ☐ Experienced domestic violence	☐ Had heavy alcohol use ☐ Smoked tobacco ☐ Used illicit drugs
☑ Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed	
Infant was born: ☐ Drug exposed ☑ With neither of the issues listed noted in case record	☐ With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
10/03/2012	8152 - Other Child - Cousin, Female, 6 Years	8036 - Other Adult - MGU's Paramour, Female, 28 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	No
	8152 - Other Child - Cousin, Female, 6 Years	8036 - Other Adult - MGU's Paramour, Female, 28 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	

Report Summary:

One of the children of the maternal great aunt (MGA) was named in a report that was investigated by the Broome County Department of Social Services (BCDSS). The subject of the report was the maternal great uncle's (MGU) paramour. The allegations of IG and SA against the paramour alleged that the paramour made the MGA's child rub up against the paramour's child in an inappropriate sexual manner.

Determination: Unfounded **Date of Determination:** 11/27/2012

Basis for Determination:

The allegations of IG and SA were UNF. The MGA's child did not disclose that any sexual contact occurred. It was documented that the MGA and the MGU were in the middle of a contested divorce and a custody battle.

OCFS Review Results:

Casework activity was commensurate with case circumstances. Safety and risk to all children in the home was assessed, as well as the need for ongoing services. The BCDSS appropriately determined the allegations of the report.

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? $\square Yes \square No$

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Perpetrator(s)		Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
03/01/2013	8155 - Other Child - Cousin, Female, 3 Years	8041 - Aunt/Uncle, Male, 47 Years	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	No
	8154 - Other Child - Cousin,	8041 - Aunt/Uncle, Male,	Sexual Abuse	Unfounded	

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 10 of 12



l l	Fomala 6 V	47 V 225-] !
D C	Female, 6 Years	47 Years			
	y: children were named in a report t tion of SA against the MGU alle				
Determination: 1	Unfounded		Date of Deter	mination: 04/25/	2013
the MGA and the OCFS Review R Casework activity as well as the nee	SA was UNF. The children did r MGU were still in the middle of	rcumstances. Safety and ripsS appropriately determine	custody battle sk to all childr ned the allegati	en in the home wa	
Are there Kequi	red Actions related to the comp	mance issue(s):	MINU		
	CPS - Investigative Histo	ory More Than Three Years	Prior to the Fat	ality	
of Social Services	ren were listed as alleged maltrea s. The report that was received or ce while caring for the two other	n 6/13/11, alleged that a su children. The report was U	bstitute caretal JNF regarding	ker in the MGA's	household wa
	Knowi	n CPS History Outside of NY	18		
There is no know	n CPS History outside of New Y	ork State.			
	Services Op	oen at the Time of the	Fatality		
		Required Action(s)			
Are there Requi	red Actions related to complian	nce issues for provisions (of CPS or Pre	ventive services ?	,
	Pi	reventive Services History			
	d of Preventive Services History iding in the deceased child's hou	-		sed child's sibling	gs, and/or the
		Required Action(s)			
Are there Requi	red Actions related to the comp	oliance issues for provision	on of Foster C	are Services?	

SY-15-036 FINAL Page 11 of 12



Foster Care Placement History

There is no record of foster care placement history provided to the deceased child, the deceased child's siblings, and/or the other children residing in the deceased child's household at the time of the fatality.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? \square Yes \boxtimes No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? $\square Yes \boxtimes No$