

Report Identification Number: BU-20-034

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

**Issue Date: Jun 11, 2021** 

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:  A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



# Abbreviations

Relationships				
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child		
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child		
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father		
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider		
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father		
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle		
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub		
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult			
	Contacts			
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner		
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services		
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother		
CPS-Child Protective Services				
	Allegations			
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts		
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding		
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse		
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect		
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive		
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision		
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other			
	Miscellaneous			
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender		
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence		
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police		
Service	Services	Department		
PPRS-Purchased Preventive	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy	FC-Foster Care		
Rehabilitative Services	Families			
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services		
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan		
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment		
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old		
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation	ASTO-Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur			



### **Case Information**

**Report Type:** Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Erie **Date of Death:** 12/14/2020

Age: 26 day(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 12/14/2020

#### **Presenting Information**

An SCR report received on 12/14/20 alleged on that same date the 1-month-old subject child (an otherwise healthy infant) was seen alive and breathing at 6:45AM. At 7:39AM the mother was sitting in a chair, co-sleeping with the infant and she found him non-responsive. The mother contacted emergency services. Emergency services found the child laying on the couch, on top of a pillow with blood coming from his nose and mouth. The infant was was taken to the hospital where he was pronounced deceased at 8:43AM. The roles of the father and surviving siblings were unknown.

#### **Executive Summary**

This report concerns the death of the 1-month-old male subject child. Erie County Department of Social Services (ECDSS) received an SCR report regarding the death on 12/14/20. The infant was an otherwise healthy child and was found deceased the morning of the report. There were concerns the subject child died as the result of co-sleeping with his mother. The infant resided in the home with his mother, father, and two siblings, ages 7 and 1 year. ECDSS assessed the safety of the surviving siblings within 24 hours of receiving the report.

In the early morning hours of 12/14/20 the mother went to sleep on the couch and placed the infant in a bouncer/rocker type chair on the floor next to her to sleep, which was routine. The mother woke some time after to feed the infant; she placed the child on the couch atop her arm. The mother and infant were covered with a thin blanket and there was a pillow under the mother on the couch. The mother woke later in the morning after the father had gone to work and found the infant lifeless, with blood coming from his nose and mouth. Emergency services were called and they responded and performed life saving measures at the home. The child was transported to the hospital and declared deceased.

Law enforcement told ECDSS the mother reported she was sleeping on her left side at a 45 degree angle and the infant was laying to her left side, not under her. The mother found the infant laying face up. Law enforcement, EMS and fire department first responders observed the parents to be sober when responding to the home the morning of the incident, therefore, no alcohol screenings administered. Law enforcement found the family to be cooperative throughout their investigation and there were no concerns regarding the safety of the home or surviving children in the parents' care. There were no criminal charges filed at the time this report was written and the criminal investigation remained open pending the final autopsy report.

The medical examiner performed an autopsy and the final report was not complete at the time of this writing. There were toxicology and metabolic culture test results still pending. The ME stated the preliminary findings suggested the cause of death to be positional asphyxiation. The ME hypothesized "the mother fell asleep while feeding the infant and crushed him."

ECDSS provided the parents with a referral for the bereavement network and grief counseling. A referral to early intervention was made for the 1yo surviving sibling. There were no other service needs identified by the family during the investigation.

ECDSS substantiated the allegation of DOA/Fatality and Inadequate guardianship against both the mother and father. ECDSS concluded that the parents routinely placed the infant in an unsafe sleeping environment despite having a bassinet in the home. On 12/14/20, The mother fell asleep on the couch with the infant while feeding him. The father found the

BU-20-034 FINAL Page 3 of 10



County where fatality incident occurred:

# **Child Fatality Report**

mother and infant sleeping together and made no attempt to wake the mother and remedy the situation. The preliminary ME findings suggested the infant died as a result of being smothered during unsafe sleep.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the	ne Fatality
Safety Assessment:  • Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:	
tiic.	
<ul> <li>Approved Initial Safety Assessment?</li> </ul>	Yes
<ul> <li>Safety assessment due at the time of determination?</li> </ul>	Yes
• Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?	Yes
Determination:	
<ul> <li>Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?</li> </ul>	Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?	Yes
Was the decision to close the case appropriate?	Yes
Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements?	Yes
Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?	Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.
Explain:	
The level of casework activity was commensurate with the case circumstances.	
Required Actions Related to the Fatality	
Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)?  \B\No	
Fatality-Related Information and Investigative	Activities
Incident Information	
Date of Death: 12/14/2020 Time of Death: Unkn	own
Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death:	Unknown

BU-20-034 **FINAL** Page 4 of 10

Erie



Was 911 or local emergenc	y number called?		Yes
Time of Call:			Unknown
Did EMS respond to the sc	ene?		Yes
At time of incident leading	to death, had child used alcohol or di	rugs?	No
Child's activity at time of i	ncident:		
	☐ Working	Driving / Veh	icle occupant
☐ Playing	☐ Eating	Unknown	
Other			
-	at time of incident leading to death? Servisor impaired? Not impaired.	Yes	
At time of incident supervi	sor was:		
Distracted		Absent	
⊠ Asleep		Other:	
Total number of deaths at	incident event:		
Children ages 0-18: 1			
Adults: 0			

### **Household Composition at time of Fatality**

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	26 Day(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	30 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	36 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	7 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	1 Year(s)
Other Household 1	Other Adult - Father to 7yo SS	No Role	Male	45 Year(s)

### **LDSS Response**

On 12/14/2020, ECDSS received an SCR report regarding the death of the subject child. ECDSS initiated their investigation within 24 hours and coordinated their efforts with LE. ECDSS contacted the source of the report, completed a CPS history check for the family and informed the DA of the fatality. ECDSS assessed the safety of the 7yo and 1yo surviving siblings and arranged for the siblings to have medical exams at the CAC. The siblings were found to be safe in the care of the SM and SF.

ECDSS learned that the evening of 12/13/20, the family was home together. The SF disclosed drinking 10-12 beers while watching a football game and the SM had also been drinking for the first time since giving birth, she had wine mixed with water and ginger ale, and wasn't a regular drinker. The SF reported heading to the bedroom at around 1:00AM. The SM joined him in the bedroom a short time later and left the bedroom about 30-45 minutes later and went to sleep on the sofa. The SF stated the SC normally slept in a rocker/bouncer chair that was placed on the floor in front of the couch where the SM slept. The SM routinely slept on the couch and the father slept in the bedroom as they found it easier for the SM to wake and breastfeed the infant from the couch. The SM reported falling asleep around 1:30AM and waking again during the night to feed the SC. After the feeding she reported the SC fell asleep on the couch with her, positioned on her left arm.



The SF woke for work at 5:40AM and observed the SM sleeping on the couch with the SC at her side. The SF checked on the SSs and kissed the SM and SC goodbye before leaving the home at 6:45AM. The SF denied seeing any blood and expressed although it was dark he would have noticed. The SM did not recall the SF leaving, but woke at 7:30AM to find the SC unresponsive, with blood coming from his nose and mouth. The SM called 911 and then called the SF at work before beginning CPR. The SF arrived home to find first responders performing CPR on the SC.

The SM and SF both reported they were sober when going to sleep in the early morning hours of 12/14/20. They denied any history of alcohol or substance abuse or treatment. Both parents acknowledged receiving safe sleep education at the hospital when the SC was born. They reported there was a bassinet in the home for the SC and they had not brought it up from the basement to use. The 1yo SS slept in a portable crib.

The 7yo and 1yo siblings were sleeping in their rooms during the incident and woke to find the first responders in the home. The 7yo was interviewed and had no knowledge of what occurred other than the SM telling her the SC had died. The 7yo SS reported feeling safe at home.

ECDSS spoke with LE, paramedics and volunteer fireman that responded to the 911 call. They reported arriving to find the SC laying on the couch with dried blood around his nose and mouth and blood on the sofa cushion. The SC 's body was still warm. They did not note any concerns regarding the condition of the home or the parents behavior. All accounts were that the parents were sober and visibly in shock.

ECDSS spoke to the father of the 7yo SS and he disclosed regular weekend visitation with the 7yo. He expressed no concerns for the care the 7yo or the other children were provided by the SM and SF.

ECDSS contacted collateral sources including the school which the 7yo SS attended, the pediatrician, hospital staff and family members. ECDSS learned the SC had not yet been to the pediatrician for his first visit but the SSs were regularly seen without concerns. The SM cancelled the initial appointment for the SC due to inclement weather and it had not yet been rescheduled at the time of his death. The 7yo was attending school remotely without concerns. There were no concerns presented regarding the care the SM and SF provided to any of the children.

### Official Manner and Cause of Death

**Official Manner:** Pending

**Primary Cause of Death:** Pending

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

#### Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?Yes

### **SCR Fatality Report Summary**

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
057141 - Deceased Child, Male, 26 Days	057142 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
057141 - Deceased Child, Male, 26 Days	057142 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated

BU-20-034 FINAL Page 6 of 10

NEW YORK STATE	Office of Children and Family Services
----------------------	--

057141 - Deceased Child, Male, 26	057143 - Father, Male, 30 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
Days			
057141 - Deceased Child, Male, 26	057143 - Father, Male, 30 Year(s)	Inadequate	Substantiated
Days		Guardianship	

### **CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	$\boxtimes$			
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	$\boxtimes$			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	$\boxtimes$			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?		$\boxtimes$		
Contact with source?		$\boxtimes$		
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	$\boxtimes$			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	$\boxtimes$			
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?				

### **Additional information:**

ECDSS attempted to contact the source of the report and were unsuccessful. The biological father of the 7yo SS was spoken to on the telephone but there were no documented attempts to interview him face to face.

### **Fatality Safety Assessment Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report:	urviving	siblings/o	ther child	dren in the
Within 24 hours?	$\boxtimes$			
At 7 days?	$\boxtimes$			
At 30 days?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?				
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?				

BU-20-034 FINAL Page 7 of 10



When safety factors were present that ple children in the household in impending of harm, were the safety interventions, incl adequate?							
Fatali	ty Diely Asso	ssmont / Dis	k Assessment	Profile			
ratan	ty Misk Asses	SSIIICIII / IXIS	K ASSUSSIIIUII	, I I UIIIC			
				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate	in this case	?					
During the course of the investigation, w gathered to assess risk to all surviving si household?							
Was there an adequate assessment of the	e family's n	eed for sei	rvices?				
Did the protective factors in this case red in Family Court at any time during or at	-		-				
Were appropriate/needed services offere	ed in this ca	ise					
DI	A . 4° °4° ° .	D	4b . T. 4 . P. 4	F			
Placement	Activities in	Kesponse to	the Fatality	investigatio	on		
				Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?							
Were there surviving children in the hou as a result of this fatality report / investi- to this fatality?							
	Legal Activ	rity Related	to the Fatality	<b>V</b>			
Legal Activity Related to the Fatality  Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.  Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality							
Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailal	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling			$\boxtimes$				
<b>Economic support</b>							
Funeral arrangements							
Housing assistance							

BU-20-034 FINAL Page 8 of 10

Mental health services					
Foster care				$\boxtimes$	
Health care				$\boxtimes$	
Legal services				$\boxtimes$	
Family planning				$\boxtimes$	
Homemaking Services				$\boxtimes$	
Parenting Skills				$\boxtimes$	
<b>Domestic Violence Services</b>				$\boxtimes$	
Early Intervention	$\boxtimes$				
Alcohol/Substance abuse				$\boxtimes$	
Child Care				$\boxtimes$	
Intensive case management				$\boxtimes$	
Family or others as safety resources				$\boxtimes$	
Other					

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? Yes

### **Explain:**

The 1yo SS was referred for early intervention services.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

### Explain:

The parents were given a bereavement network referral and a listing of grief counseling service providers.

### **History Prior to the Fatality**

Child Information				
Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?		No		
Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?	No			
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this	No			
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?		No		
Infants Under One Year O	Old			
During pregnancy, mother:		Had heavy alcohol use		
During pregnancy, mother:  Had medical complications / infections	Had heavy alcol	ol use		
During pregnancy, mother:  Had medical complications / infections  Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs	☐ Had heavy alcoh☐ Smoked tobacco			
Had medical complications / infections		•		

BU-20-034 FINAL Page 9 of 10



Infant was born:  ☐ Drug exposed ☐ With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome ☐ With neither of the issues listed noted in case record						
CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality						
There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the fatality.						
CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality						
In 2014 the 7yo SS was an alleged maltreated child in a CPS investigation. The subject of the report was the daycare provider and the allegations of inadequate guardianship and lack of supervision were unsubstantiated in regard to the 7yo SS.						
Known CPS History Outside of NYS						
There is no known CPS history outside of New York State.						
Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality						
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity						
Additional Local District Comments						
We at the Erie County Department of Social Services appreciate the opportunity given us to review the draft report in advance. We find that the facts, as written, describe the unfortunate events and the actions taken in response. We are pleased that OCFS found that the fatality investigation was conducted appropriately and that there are no required actions related to the fatality.						
Recommended Action(s)						
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? ☐Yes ☒No  Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? ☐Yes ☒No						

BU-20-034 FINAL Page 10 of 10