

Report Identification Number: BU-18-001

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Jun 18, 2018

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns: A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships						
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child				
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child				
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father				
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider				
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father				
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle				
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub				
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult					
	Contacts					
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner				
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services				
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother				
CPS-Child Protective Services						
	Allegations					
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts				
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding				
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse				
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect				
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive				
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision				
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other					
	Miscellaneous					
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender				
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence				
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police				
Service	Services	Department				
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care				
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services				
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan				
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment				
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old				
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation						



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Erie **Date of Death:** 01/12/2018

Age: 1 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 01/12/2018

Presenting Information

On 1/12/18, the SF fell asleep on the couch while holding the one-month-old SC. When the SF awoke, the SC was not breathing. The SC was pronounced dead at 3:56AM. There were no known preexisting medical conditions for the SC.

Executive Summary

Erie County Department of Social Services (ECDSS) received an SCR report on 1/12/2018, with allegations of DOA/fatality and IG against the SF for the one-month-old SC. The SC died from unknown causes and was an otherwise healthy child. An SCR and criminal history check were completed and reviewed. Based on the reviewed SCR history, ECDSS appropriately addressed possible alcohol and drug misuse with the parents. The parents denied any misuse of substances.

The SF said the SM went upstairs to sleep and he was downstairs with the SC and the 4yo SS. The 1yo SS was upstairs with the SM. The SF said he placed the SC in his swing to sleep around 10pm and he awoke sometime during the night for a glass of water. The SF told ECDSS that he took the SC from the swing and had fallen back to sleep on the couch with the SC in his arms. The 4yo SS was asleep on the other couch. The SF awoke with the SC still in his arms at 3:30AM and found the child unresponsive. He ran upstairs to the SM who called 911 and CPR was administered until EMS arrived.

The ME performed an autopsy the preliminary findings were the cause of death appeared to be the result of co-sleeping asphyxiation. The ME stated that the SC had three posterior rib fractures that were healing and suspicious in nature. The ME's office had made a referral to an anthropologist for further examination. The ME had informed ECDSS that the SC looked great otherwise and had no other injuries. The ME said the SC did not even have a scratch on him and appeared to be well nourished. The final autopsy results were still pending at the time of the writing of this report.

LE was waiting for the final autopsy results; no criminal charges were pursued in relation to the fatality at the time of the writing of this report. LE told ECDSS that they believed the death was accidental due to co-sleeping.

ECDSS assessed the safety of the SC's four SSs and their households. ECDSS located the two SSs who resided with their BM and had no contact with the SF or the two other SS and their household. ECDSS had so safety concerns. ECDSS assessed the safety of the two SSs who lived in the SC's home and put a temporary safety plan in place. The SM and the SSs went to stay with the MGM and the SF was to have no contact. Everyone agreed to the safety plan.

ECDSS requested and reviewed all pertinent medical records of the SC. ECDSS completed all safety assessments and child fatality reports timely and accurately.

ECDSS offered the family bereavement services and burial assistance. ECDSS continued to monitor the safety plan and made referrals for services to meet the needs of all family members.

ECDSS Sub the allegations of DOA/fatality and inadequate guardianship against the SM and the SF for the SC. Based on interviews with collaterals and all members of the household it was learned that the SF and the SM often co-slept with the SC on a regular basis. ECDSS observed a portable crib in the home that was filled with various items and clearly was not being used for the SC to sleep in. By the parents own admissions they were educated about safe sleep and the MGM had

BU-18-001 FINAL Page 3 of 12



talked to the SF especially about this on numerous occasions. There was some credible evidence based on the above-mentioned interviews and the ME's preliminary report stated the cause of death appeared to be asphyxiation due to unsafe sleep. The parents failed to provide a minimum degree of care; they placed the child in imminent risk of harm by co-sleeping with the child on a regular basis, even though they had been educated on the dangers of co-sleeping. They failed to provide the child with a safe sleep environment, even though they had a portable crib for the child to sleep in. LE and EMS reported to ECDSS that they believed the death was the result of unsafe sleep. ECDSS IND and opened the case for services and CPS monitored required. At the time of this report the family was engaged in services and fully cooperating with ECDSS.

	Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the	ne Fatality
•	Assessment: Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:	
	 Approved Initial Safety Assessment? 	Yes
	o Safety assessment due at the time of determination?	Yes
	Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?	Yes
Detern	nination:	
•	Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?	Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
	Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?	Yes
Explai ECDS: member	S conducted a thorough investigation and provided all necessary services need	eded to meet the needs of all family
Was th	ne decision to close the case appropriate?	N/A
	nsework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory platory requirements?	Yes
Was th	nere sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?	Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.
Explai N/A	n:	

BU-18-001 FINAL Page 4 of 12

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? \square Yes \square No

Required Actions Related to the Fatality



Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

incident information				
Date of Death: 01/12/2018		Time of Death: 03	3:56 AM	
County where fatality incident	occurred:			Erie
Was 911 or local emergency nu	ımber called?			Yes
Time of Call:				03:19 AM
Did EMS respond to the scene	?			Yes
At time of incident leading to d	leath, had child used alco	ohol or drugs?		No
Child's activity at time of incid	ent:			
	☐ Working		Driving / Vehic	cle occupant
☐ Playing	☐ Eating		Unknown	
Other				
Did child have supervision at t	ime of incident leading to	death? Yes		
Is the caretaker listed in the He	ousehold Composition? Y	Yes - Caregiver 2		
At time of incident supervisor	was:			
☐ Drug Impaired		Absent		
Alcohol Impaired		⊠ Asleep		
Distracted		☐ Impaired by	y illness	
☐ Impaired by disability		Other:		
Total number of deaths at inci	dent event:			
Children ages 0-18: 1				
Adults: 0				

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	1 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	37 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	27 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	1 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	4 Year(s)

LDSS Response

ECDSS conducted a joint investigation with LE. Upon receipt of the SCR report on 1/12/17, ECDSS conducted interviews with the SM and the BF at their home. The parents reported the events of the evening into the morning leading up to the death of the one-month-old SC. The parents told ECDSS that they had been to a neighbor's home for dinner with the children the evening of 1/12/17. The SF and the SM said the SF had a few beers but the SM did not. They said they arrived



home about 8:30PM. The SF told ECDSS that he often slept downstairs because it was too hot upstairs. He said that evening he told the SM to go up to bed as she had to work in the morning. He stayed downstairs with the SC and the 4yo SS. The 1yo SS was upstairs with the SM. The SF said he put the SC to sleep in his swing in the living room and he went to sleep on the small couch; the SS went to sleep on the large couch. He said sometime during the night he awoke for a glass of water. He took the SC out of the swing and cradled him in one arm on his chest and his other hand on his stomach. At 3:30AM he awoke and found the SC still in his arms and unresponsive. He ran upstairs to the SM and he called 911 while she performed CPR until EMS arrived and transported the SC to the hospital.

ECDSS appropriately questioned the parents about safe sleep. They said they were educated on safe sleep and ECDSS observed a portable crib in the home filled with various items of the parents. The parents had all necessary supplies for the SC and there were no observable safety concerns in the home.

ECDSS interviewed and examined the 4yo SS and observed and examined the 1yo SS. Based on the ME's findings of rib fractures on the SC, ECDSS had the parents bring the children to the hospital for full skeletal exams. The skeletal exams were negative. Both children had headlice and the 1yo SS had an ear infection. ECDSS interviewed the parents and collateral contacts, it was unknown how the SC sustained the rib factures.

It was learned through interviews with all family members and collaterals able to provide information about the care of the SC, that the parents co slept with the SC on a regular basis. The MGM said she had spoken to both parents about this on several occasions. The SF admitted to LE that the MGM had spoken to him about co-sleeping. ECDSS assessed the safety of the SSs and there were safety concerns for the SSs. ECDSS with the agreement of all family members put a safety plan in place until further investigation could be completed. The SF was to have no contact with the SSs and the SM and the children would stay with the MGM.

ECDSS appropriately offered all family members bereavement counseling. The SF had SSs that resided with their mother. ECDSS contacted the mother and assessed their safety in their home and there were no safety concerns. The mother had full custody and the SF had no visitation or contact with the children.

ECDSS obtained and reviewed all medical records pertaining to the death of the SC as well as the SC's care. ECDSS obtained medical records for the SSs and they were behind on well care. ECDSS obtained and reviewed records from LE, EMS and all first responders. ECDSS offered preventive services to the parents and they agreed to services. ECDSS continued to monitor the safety of the SS and provided services to meet the needs of all family members. ECDSS modified the safety plan and the SF and SM were together with the SSs and engaged in services.

The ME's preliminary findings noted three posterior rib fractures and referred the finding to an anthropologist for further examination. The ME said they were not related to the death of the child. The ME said it appeared the SC died from asphyxiation due to unsafe sleep. The ME findings were that the SC had no other injuries and no marks on the body and appeared to be well nourished. The final autopsy results were still pending at the time of the writing of this report and there were no arrests.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Pending

Primary Cause of Death: Unknown

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

BU-18-001 FINAL Page 6 of 12



Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?No

Comments: ECDSS does not have an OCFS approved CFRT.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
046581 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	046585 - Father, Male, 37 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
046581 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	046585 - Father, Male, 37 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated
046581 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	046585 - Father, Male, 37 Year(s)	Fractures	Substantiated
046581 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	046584 - Mother, Female, 27 Year(s)	Fractures	Substantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	\boxtimes			
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	\boxtimes			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	\square			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
Contact with source?	\boxtimes			
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	\boxtimes			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	\boxtimes			
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?				
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?				
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?				

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine			
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	\boxtimes						
Was there an adequate safety assessment of impending or immediate danger to surviving siblings/other children in the household named in the report:							
Within 24 hours?	\boxtimes						

BU-18-001 FINAL Page 7 of 12



At 7 days?	\boxtimes			
At 30 days?	\boxtimes			
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?				
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?		\boxtimes		
When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?	\boxtimes			
Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment	Profile			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	\boxtimes			
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?	\boxtimes			
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	\boxtimes			
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?				
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case	\boxtimes			
Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality In	nvestigatio	n		
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?				
Were there surviving children in the household that were removed either as a result of this fatality report / investigation or for reasons unrelated to this fatality?				
Explain as necessary: No children were removed from the home. The SM and the SF fully complied services.	with ECD	SS and aş	greed to v	oluntary

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

BU-18-001 FINAL Page 8 of 12



Have any Orders of Protection been issued? No

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling							
Economic support							
Funeral arrangements							
Housing assistance							
Mental health services	\boxtimes						
Foster care							
Health care							
Legal services							
Family planning							
Homemaking Services							
Parenting Skills							
Domestic Violence Services							
Early Intervention							
Alcohol/Substance abuse							
Child Care							
Intensive case management	\boxtimes						
Family or others as safety resources	\boxtimes						
Other	\boxtimes						
Other, specify: Preventive services							

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

ECDSS offered referrals and services to all family member to address the immediate needs of the children and the adults. Preventive services were opened for the family. Referrals for speech therapy for the 4yo SS and Early Interventions services were offered for the 1yo SS. Bereavement referrals were made for the 4yo SS.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

ECDSS offered bereavement referrals and assistance with burial costs to the family. Preventive services were opened for the family. ECDSS based on the SF history with the SF and the SM, domestic violence services were offered to the SM.



History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information			
Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death? Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?	child's death?	No No No Yes No	
Infants Under One Year O	old		
During pregnancy, mother: ☐ Had medical complications / infections ☐ Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs ☐ Experienced domestic violence ☐ Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed	☐ Had heavy alcohol☐ Smoked tobacco☐ Used illicit drugs	use	
Infant was born: ☐ Drug exposed ☐ With neither of the issues listed noted in case record	☐ With fetal alcohol €	effects or syndrome	

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)
06/05/2016	Sibling, Female, 2 Years	Father, Male, 36 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Indicated	No
	Sibling, Female, 2 Years	1	Parents Drug / Alcohol Misuse	Indicated	

Report Summary:

On 6/5/16, the SF returned home highly intoxicated. A verbal altercation ensued and the SF smacked the SM on the legs several times, in the presence of the then 2yo SS. The SF was pregnant and she assumed a defensive posture to protect her stomach. In the midst of the assault on the SM, the 2yo SS was hit in the face.

Determination: Indicated **Date of Determination:** 07/06/2016

Basis for Determination:

ECDSS interviewed the SM,SF,LE and collateral contacts. The SM was arrested and was in jail at the time of the report. The SF did assault the SM and the 2yo SS did sustain a bruise and was afraid. Collaterals contacts confirmed that the SF verbally and physically abuses the SM in the presence of the 2yo SS. The child told ECDSS that her father hit her and her mother and she was afraid. A full stay away order of protection was issued and the SF agreed to complete a Domestic Violence Offender program. The allegations of PD/AM and IG were sub against the SF for the SS. The case was IND and closed.

OCFS Review Results:

ECDSS gathered sufficient information to make a determination.

BU-18-001 FINAL Page 10 of 12



SIAIE a	nd ramily Services		ity itepoit	
Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No				
The there required receives related to the compliance assume(s).				
CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality				
3/24/02-Alleg 4/13/02-Alleg 4/22/02-Allag 7/15/02-Alleg 8/2/02-Allega FSS-opened fi 11/05/12-alleg	ations of PD/AM, IF/C ations of PD/AM, IF/C ations of PD/AM, IF/C ations of PD/AM, LS a tions of PD/AM and IC com 5/14/05 to 7/6/05.	Known CPS History	st the SF and the BM2. st the SF and the BM2. st the SF and the BM2. he SF and the BM2. and the BM2. be against the SF for children the SF had with BM3.	
Preventive Services History				
Trevenue del vices mistery				
			reed for adoption. Those children were freed for adoption e SSs listed in the fatality report.	
		Foster Care Place	ement History	
The SF had other children with BM2 and those children were freed for adoption. BM2 and the SF used drugs to the point of not being able to care for the children and were not able to maintain safe and stable housing. The SF failed to work with the county and surrendered his parental rights for those children. Those children were freed for adoption over ten years ago and never had any contact with the SC or the SSs in the fatality report.				
Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality				
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? ☐Family Court ☐Criminal Court ☐Order of Protection				
	I			
Date Charges Filed:	Against Whom?	Date of Disposition:	Disposition:	
Unknown	SF	Unknown	completion of a domestic violence offner program	
Comments:				

Have any Orders of Protection been issued? Yes

BU-18-001 FINAL Page 11 of 12



From: Unknown	To: Unknown
Explain:	
See above. The SF did successfully co fatality.	emplete the program and there was no order in place at the time of the reported
	Additional Local District Comments
advance. We find that the facts, as writt pleased that OCFS found that the fatalit	ocial Services appreciate the opportunity given us to review the draft report in ten, describe the unfortunate events and the actions taken in response. We are ty investigation was conducted appropriately and that there are no required actions estigation conducted during the three years preceding the fatality.
·	Recommended Action(s)
Are there any recommended actions	for local or state administrative or policy changes? ☐Yes ⊠No
Are there any recommended prevent	ion activities resulting from the review? Yes No